Copyright © the author(s)

Implementation of Scaffolding on Differentiated Learning English at Junior High School

Nur Fitriyani[1]
Citra Prasiska Puspita Tohamba[2]
Muflihun Muflihun[3]

[1,2,3]Universitas Muhammadiyah Kendari, Indonesia

[1]nurf77080@gmail.com
[2]citra@umkendari.ac.id

Abstract

The objective of this study as to investigate the implementation of scaffolding method in differentiated learning used by English teacher at SMP Negeri 9 Kendari. This study employed qualitative design which used observation and interview as instrument. The subject of this study was an English who has been teaching English for 5 years. The data of this study was analyzed by using Miles and Huberman (2014) qualitative data analyzed. The findings of this study showed that the English teacher has applied scaffolding process according to McKenzie's theory (1999). The process was, scaffolding clear direction, scaffolding clarifies purpose, scaffolding keeps students on task, scaffolding offers assessment to clarify expectation, scaffolding points students to worthy sources, scaffolding reduces uncertainties, surprise, and disappointment, scaffolding delivers efficiency, and scaffolding creates momentum.

Keywords: *Differentiated learning, Scaffolding,*

Introduction

Currently, education in Indonesia is based on an Independent Curriculum (Kurikulum Merdeka), in which teachers in schools are free to implement various teaching methods, not merely one particular method. A study conducted by Sari, et al., (2023) confirms this. They said, the Kurikulum Merdeka is now being implemented in Indonesia with a new learning and evaluation paradigm, namely learning that matches students' learning requirements. As a result, differentiated learning is well suited for use in educational units.

Differentiated learning is students-centered learning, the teacher only develops their learning based on students' level of knowledge, learning preferences and interests. According to Kalantizis and cope (2017), is a philosophy that students know and who they are before they arrive at class and work with them to achieve what they need to learn. It is a way of thinking about actively engaging kids in meaningful activities and real-world topics. Teaching, in this sense, attempts to exhibit improved understanding, optimize topic knowledge, and increase the learning skills of various learners. Educators have traditionally used a didactic approach in which all students learn the same things (content) in the same (process) with the same assessment (production) in the same area (learning environment) using a one-size-fits-all approach. Without consideration for their varied individual needs, all students read the same texts, listen to the same lectures, and execute the same activities at the same time and location.

Scaffolding is a learning technique in which the teacher models the intended learning strategy or activity before gradually handing over responsibility to the students. This form of contact is compatible with Vygotsky's (1978) notion that learning is a social rather than an individual process, and it occurs in the classroom when students interact with their teachers and each other. Scaffolding is a procedure in which a teacher provides students with a temporary framework for learning. Students are encouraged to enhance their creativity, motivation, and resourcefulness when scaffolding is done effectively. The framework's foundations are revealed as students gain knowledge and improve their skills. The scaffolding is eliminated at the end of the lesson, and students no longer require it.

Even though numerous scholars are working on differentiated learning and scaffolding, there is a paucity of studies on using differentiated learning and scaffolding in English language acquisition. According to my search of the literature, there is a lot of research on differentiated learning that includes scaffolding, although not on English language learning, but on learning in general. For example, Kamal's research (2021) focuses on how to employ differentiation to improve students' understanding of mathematics learning, particularly in the subject of space. In addition, Masinading and Gaylo (2022) argue that there is a substantial association between academic achievement and self-confidence in Mathematics among students who are taught utilizing various scaffolding approaches. Concerns regarding enhancing pupils' mathematical literacy can thus be addressed using various scaffolding tactics.

The research question of this study is “How the teacher implements the scaffolding”? The purpose of this study is to investigate how scaffolding is implemented in differentiated learning by one of the English Teacher. The researcher gives a prior study in this section, which unquestionably supports this argument regarding the implementation of Scaffolding in differentiated learning. Review of relevant literature, Differentiated learning, according to Tomlison (2000), is a concept, principle, or philosophy for effective teaching that involves different pupils from various backgrounds. In other terms, 'Differentiation' refers to personalizing training to match the needs of each individual. Whether teachers differentiate between material, process, product, or learning environment, the use of assessment and grouping is a successful teaching strategy. Butler and Lowe (2008) proposed student needs to maximize each student's potential. Scaffolding is a learning technique in which the teacher models the intended learning strategy or activity before gradually handing over responsibility to the students. This form of contact is compatible with Vygotsky's (1978) notion that learning is a social rather than an individual process, and it occurs in the classroom when students interact with their teachers and each other. Scaffolding is a procedure in which a teacher provides students with a temporary framework for learning. Students are encouraged to enhance their creativity, motivation, and resourcefulness when scaffolding is done effectively. The framework's foundations are revealed as students gain knowledge and improve their skills. The scaffolding is eliminated at the end of the lesson, and students no longer require it.

According to Mkenzie (1999, pp. 3-6), the characteristics of scaffolding are: 1) Scaffolding provide clear directions. Teacher anticipates the problems that might occur by giving instruction step by step explain what students must do in order to achieve the expectation for the learning activity. 2) Scaffolding clarifies purpose. Scaffolding let the students to know why they are doing the work and why it is important. Their work

remains purposeful and painful. When they do the work, it is in service to the thought process, the learn of meaning and the development of knowledge. 3) Scaffolding keeps of students on task. By providing structure and guidance, the students can exercise individually or in tea without fear. 4) Scaffolding offer assessment to clarify expectations. The expectations that the teacher want to achieve are told at the beginning by providing examples of quality work done by others. The students are shown rubrics and standards that define a good quality. 5) Scaffolding points students to worthy sources. Teacher provides sources to reduce confusion and wasting time. Then the students can choose these sources to use.6) Scaffolding reduces uncertainties, surprise and disappointment. Teacher is expected to test every step in the lesson to see the possibility go wrong, in order to eliminate the frustrations or difficulties and goal is to maximize of learning and efficiency. 7) Scaffolding delivers efficiency. Scaffolding refines focus, clarity, work effort and time on task. 8) Scaffolding creates momentum. Through scaffolding the communication motivation, thought, understanding, and knowledge are achieved.

Method

The researcher will apply a qualitative research design according to Cohen et al (2018). In the research, the data will be obtained through two techniques: observation, and interview. The researcher will carry out observation by observing the process of class activities, by setting at the of the class and the back of the class. Researcher will collect data during observation by recording all activities during the teaching and learning process and carrying out documentation. The researcher will interview teacher at school, using English and Indonesia, and record using headphone when the researcher will conduct the interview. The research instrument by observation sheet is developed from McKenzie's (1999) theory about the characteristics of scaffolding. As this research aims to see how the teacher in this study implements the scaffolding in her class This study will analyze the data proposed by Miles and Huberman, (2014), by using the following three ways: a) Data Reduction, a data reduction process to select, focus, abstracting, summary, and transforming the data that the emerged from the field notes is analysis. Data reduction means simplify or to make summary, choosing subject matter, focusing on the important things, looking for themes and patterns, as well as throw deemed unnecessary. Thus, the purpose of data reduction is to provide a more specific and researcher conducted to facilitate the data collection as well as looking for additional data if needed. b) Data display, After reducing the data, the next step is the presentation of analysis data (display). The data display is then directed to the result of data reduction organized, and arranged in a relationship pattern so that the data is easier to understand. The presentation of the data will be done in the form of narration, and such. The presentation of data will allow researcher to understand what is happening, so that it enables researcher to plan future research work. c) conclusion drawing, Data drawing/ verification of conclusion is the final stage in the process of qualitative analysis of data to draw conclusions based on the findings and verification of data. The conclusion image is also a process of concluding content to collect data in the form of a good statement and have clear data. The process of concluding can be started by providing a tentative conclusion that still need to be completed. Verification Is a process that is done to test the interim.

Results and Discussion

1) Providing clear direction

Based on the first day observation, conducted on 25 March 2024, the researcher found that the teacher gives clear direction for the students in the early process to learning. First, teacher give the topic was about "giving direction" where the teacher gradually explained how to ask and give direction. Second, the teacher showed a map on city landscape. For example, library, school, hospital, red light, etc.) with teacher explained in a high tone of voice and with clear movements and expression. Third, the teacher asked the purpose of the teacher explaining and giving examples is so that students understand to make a map drawing by writing vocabulary in English. In the second day observation, conducted on 20 may 2024, the researcher found that the teacher gives clear direction for the students in the early process to learning. It was seen that the teacher was still giving the same topic, namely about direction. The teacher provides clear direction in a way, first the teacher gives an example, (the teacher moves the hand facing on the right and on the left, straight, and turns and is followed by the students by saying, on the right, on the left, straight, and turn) with teacher explained in a high tone of voice and with clear movements and expression. Second, the teacher ensures that students understand the explanation by asking students to do as exemplified. Third, the teacher asks students to return to the material, and gives students the opportunity to ask questions.

Based on the results of the interview, the teacher stated that students can understand the directions given by the teacher, with several ways to ensure student understanding. this is related to the results of the interview excerpt as follows.

Question 1: Can students understand the clear directions given by the teacher?

Teacher: *"I think students understand what is explained, with several ways to ensure students' understanding: first, the teacher asks the students directly. second, checking students' work. and third providing additional explanations individually if needed. This shows his active commitment in helping students understand the material and complete the assignment well".*

Scaffolding provides clear direction. Based on the researcher's findings that the teacher applies provide clear direction, explaining in a high tone of voice, with clear movements and expressions. The steps that the teacher provides, first explain the topic that will be learned that day (direction). Second, the teacher asks what English direction is. And third the teacher gives an example. After giving examples, the teacher ensures that students understand the explanation by asking students to do things as exemplified by the teacher. When the teacher explains in a high voice, by giving examples of clear movements and expressions, it makes students understand the explanation given by the teacher. This can also be proven by Noraini Idris (2005), stating that teachers need to emphasize and raise their voices to provide understanding to students. Because of that, teachers need to have the skills to apply a good tone of voice when giving instructions by emphasizing important parts during the instruction speech to be understood by students.

2) Scaffolding clarifies purpose

Based on the first day observation, conducted on 25 March 2024, the researcher not found that the teacher gives clarifies purpose for the students in the early process to

learning. First the teacher explained the previous lesson. Second, the teacher asked the students a question and the guessed the question. Third, the teacher immediately continued the new material. So, from the observation researcher saw the teacher did not clarify the purpose. In the second day observation, conducted on 20 may 2024, researcher saw the teacher clarify the purpose by writing the learning objectives on the board, and the teacher explained what the purpose was. Teacher said “so students the purpose of today's lesson, we will make a conversation about direction”. From what researcher saw during the observation. That the teacher was only limited to explaining. So, in my opinion, the teacher clarifies the purpose was still lacking where the teacher does not emphasize the importance of the purpose of the meaning of the learning. As in everyday life, for example. “When there are new people or strangers, they asked about directions, then with that we can help the new person by showing the directions we have learned”. Based on observation, the teacher clarifies purpose but does not emphasize the importance of the purpose of the meaning of learning in everyday life.

Based on the results of the interview, the teacher stated that the lesson learned had only one benefit for students. This is related to the results of the interview quote as follows.

Question 2: Do students understand the purpose of the lessons they learn that have a purpose and benefits?

Teacher: *The teacher only provides one clear benefit that was sufficient in learning, namely understanding the way from home to school with pictures and writing. According to the teacher, students can explore other benefits at another time."*

Scaffolding clarifies purpose. Based on the researcher's findings that the teacher applies clarifies the purpose, in a way. First, the teacher writes the learning objectives on the board. Second, the teacher explains what the purpose is. Teacher said "so students the purpose of learning today, we will make a conversation about direction". Based on the explanation that has been stated, it can be concluded that learning objectives are not only a design in the form of writing, but should be realized in reality in the classroom. Teachers who prioritize designing learning objectives that can be applied in the classroom can improve the quality of learning, Nesari & Heidari (2014).

3) Scaffolding keeps students on task

Based on the first day observation, conducted on 25 March 2024, the researcher found that the teacher gives keeps students on task for the students in the early process to learning. First the teacher always monitors and goes around the class. Second, the teacher ensures that students are on task during the learning process. Third, the teacher helps students who are having difficulty by explained the material again. In the second day observation, conducted on 20 may 2024, the researcher found that the teacher give keeps students on task. First the teacher always monitors and goes around the class. Second, the teacher ensures that students do the task correctly. Third, the teacher helps students who are struggling by explaining the task directions in more detail. Fourth, the teacher provides feedback on student work. And fifth, the teacher provides individual and group guidance. Researcher as a researcher saw the teacher give keeps students on task. Students are enthusiastic about doing the task. However, there are some students who researcher see less enthusiastic, such as students working on the task until the time runs out there are still some students who have not finished working on it.

Based on the results of the interview, the teacher stated that it was normal for students to be slow in doing students assignments. This is related to the results of interview quotes as follows.

Question 3: How do you deal with students who have not finished doing the assignment while the time is up?

Teacher: *"In a normal class. The class is heterogeneous. some are smart, some are average, and some are lacking. There are students who are slow to work on problems, there are also students who are quick to work on problems. The important thing is that first the teacher provides individual guidance to students who need more time to do the task. Support in the form of explanations, leading questions, and examples that can help them achieve the learning objectives. If necessary, they can complete the task at home or at a later time. The important thing is that students are actively involved in the learning process according to their abilities".*

Scaffolding keeps students on task. Based on the researcher's findings that the teacher applies keeps students on task. By First, the teacher always monitors and goes around the class. Second, the teacher ensures that students are on task during the learning process. Third, the teacher helps students who are struggling by explaining the material again. Fourth, the teacher provides feedback on student work. And fifth, the teacher provides individual and group guidance, so that the application of keeping students' given by the teacher can motivate students. Although there are some students who are less enthusiastic about doing the task. Like the time given runs out so the task is not completed. However, the teacher gives students the opportunity to complete the task at home. The important thing is that students are actively involved in learning according to their abilities. Iv & Gondosuli, (2020) state that effective learning is learning that provides opportunities for self-learning or doing the widest possible activities for students to learn, especially when giving homework the influence of a teacher is great, children generally appreciate a teacher when the teacher is happy with the children. Those who teach must begin to find and attract interest and attention, and do not think that what the teacher is interested in will be interested in the children. Often, it is just a coincidence that teachers and students hit it off right away, and one form of partnership between school and family can be the assignment of homework by the teacher.

4) Scaffolding offers assessment to clarify expectation

Based on the first day observation, conducted on 25 March 2024, the researcher found that the teacher gives offers assessment to clarify expectations for the students in the early process to learning. First the teacher gives an example. Teacher said, "you going to school by walk, what is walk? teacher gave an example with (Walking movement)". Second, the teacher gives an example of a map image through the WA (WhatsApp) online group. As a reference for assignments made by students. Third, the teacher gives an example of a map of his house to school on the board by explaining it. Fourth Students are given an assessment rubric, and assessment standards. so that students are motivated to do the task. In the second day observation, conducted on 20 may 2024, the researcher found that the teacher gives offers assessment to clarify expectations. First the teacher writes down the expected expectations. Second, the teacher provides an example of conversation direction through the WA group, (WhatsApp). as a reference for the task to be made. Third, the teacher provides an assessment rubric and assessment standards. So that students are motivated to do the task correctly and well. From my observations,

researcher saw that the teacher gave a rubric for one complete conversation of at least seven and a map image. There are several students that researcher saw when students saw the rubric given by students having difficulty.

Based on the results of the interview, the teacher stated that had offers an assessment to clarify expectation, with the teacher provided a rubric to help students know what was expected and increase motivation. This is related to the results of interview quotes as follows.

Question 4: Does providing this rubric help students get the score they expect?

Teacher: *"yes of course. With the grading rubric it can help students know what to expect and increase motivation. Although there are variations in students' abilities and motivation, with this rubric, I give extra time if needed to ensure all students achieve the learning objectives, albeit with varying results".*

5) Scaffolding points students to worthy sources

Based on the first day observation, conducted on 25 March 2024, the researcher found that the teacher gives points students to worthy sources for the students in the early process to learning. The teacher provided scaffolding points students to worthy sources, with only one reference, namely a map image sent via WA, (WhatsApp). In the second day observation, conducted on 20 may 2024, the researcher found that the teacher gives points students to worthy sources, with only one reference, namely a conversation text about directions. Which was sent through the WA group, (WhatsApp).

Based on the results of the interview, the teacher stated that had given students points to worthy sources, with the teacher giving students the freedom to look for references. This was related to the results of interview quotes as follows.

Question 5: Why do teachers only provide one reference?

Teacher: *"To give students the freedom to search for references on the internet because students have access to the internet through their cellphones. Which allows them to find various references more freely and widely, without being limited to only one reference".*

Scaffolding points students to worthy sources. Based on the researcher's findings that the teacher applies points students to worthy, with only one reference. Because the teacher gives students the freedom to look for references on the internet because students have internet access through their cellphones. Which allows them to find references more freely and widely. Without being limited to only one reference. According to Sudjana (2010: 16) all kinds of sources that exist outside a person (learner) and that allow or facilitate the learning process are referred to as learning resources.

6) Scaffolding reduces uncertainties, surprise, and disappointment

Based on the first day observation, conducted on 25 March 2024, the researcher found that the teacher gives reduces uncertainties, surprise, and disappointment for the students in the early process to learning. First the teacher always checks the students' writing again. Second, the teacher reads how to pronunciation, and third, the teacher gives the opportunity for students to read back what the teacher has read. In the second day observation, conducted on 20 may 2024, the researcher found that the teacher gives

reduces uncertainties, surprise, and disappointment for students in the early process to learning. First, every time the teacher finished explaining the material, the teacher always checks the students' writing again. Second, the teacher tests students' understanding so that they are not mistaken. For example, after teaching about direction. The teacher always tests some students to model what has been done. After that, students read the direction conversation. Third, the teacher checks whether students understand the contents of the conversation text. Fourth, the teacher asks the meaning, asks 5 W + 1 H, related to the direction conversation text.

Based on the results of the interview, the teacher stated that she had reduced uncertainties, surprise, and disappointment, with most students doing their assignments well. This was related to the results of interview quotes as follows.

Question 6: Are there students who do not do the assignment?

Teacher: *"Most students do the assignments well. Because the teacher job was to ensure all students to do the task and the teacher helps students overcome the obstacles they face".*

Scaffolding reduces uncertainties, surprise, and disappointment. Based on the researcher's findings that the teacher applies reduces uncertainties, surprise, and disappointment, in a way, first the teacher always checks the students' writing again and the teacher always communicates if the students do not understand. By re-checking students' writing, the teacher ensures that the information conveyed by students is correct and as expected. This helps reduce students' uncertainty about the results of their work because there is immediate feedback that ensures correctness. Secondly, the teacher reads how to pronunciation. Thirdly, the teacher provides an opportunity to read back what the teacher has read. Fourth, the teacher tests students' understanding with a conversation text so that they are not mistaken. So that most of them do the task well because the teacher ensures all students to do the task and the teacher helps students overcome the obstacles that students face. Communication is considered to play a key role in the process of reducing uncertainty in a person Gibbs et.al., (2011).

7) Scaffolding delivers efficiency

Based on the first day observation, conducted on 25 March 2024, the researcher found that the teacher gives delivers efficiency for the students in the early process to learning. First, teacher gives forty minutes to draw the direction of the map from their home, to school. Second, the teacher explained to the students what they passed when they went to school and wrote it down with English vocabulary. for example (schools, hospitals, red lights and other places). In the second day observation, conducted on 20 may 2024, the researcher found that the teacher gives delivers efficiency for students in the early process to learning. In a way, the teacher gives forty minutes to work on conversation direction questions and map drawings. From the observations that researcher saw, the teacher gave forty minutes to do the task. I saw that with the time given there were several students who had not finished, while the time given was up.

Based on the results of the interview, the teacher stated that she had delivered efficiency, by providing guidance to students so they could maximize students' abilities. This was related to the results of interview quotes as follows.

Question: What is the teacher solution so that students can do their assignments on time?

Teacher: *"In the learning process, it was important to provide guidance to students so that they can maximize their abilities. However, if students are still unable to complete the assignment after guidance and direction are given, I will give two options: first, using the break time to complete the assignment if they are distracted by other activities such as playing. Second, providing additional time for students who need it on the condition that the task is done seriously".*

Scaffolding delivers efficiency. Based on the researcher's findings that the teacher applies efficiency, in a way, first the teacher gives forty minutes to do the task. Second, the teacher explains to students how to do the task by giving examples. However, given forty minutes there are some students who have not finished working on the assignment given. The solution given by the teacher is to provide guidance to students so that they can maximize their abilities. However, if students are still unable to complete the task after the guidance and direction given then there are two options given by the teacher: first using the break time to do the task. The second is to provide additional time for students who need it on condition that they do it seriously. Sutiah (2016) argues that learning is said to be effective if the planned learning objectives can be achieved both in quantity and quality in accordance with the time set. Meanwhile, learning is said to be efficient if learning objectives can be achieved appropriately, both regarding costs and energy.

8) Scaffolding creates momentum

Based on the first day observation, conducted on 25 March 2024, the researcher found that the teacher gives cerates momentum for the students in the early process to learning. The researcher saw, the situation in the class was very conducive, where all students worked on assignments. Every time the teacher asked many students raised their hands to answer the questions given by the teacher. So, the class was very active. Making the class very conducive to learning. In the second day observation, conducted on 20 may 2024, the researcher found that the teacher gives cerates momentum in the early process to learning. The researcher saw, the situation in the class was very conducive, where all students worked on assignments. they have enough motivation. Evidenced by students discussing with fellow friends to asked questions, looking for the meaning of vocabulary on google translate. However, when the teacher provides information, there are some students who also communicate with fellow friends, so that the teacher provides information or explanations that make other students not focus on receiving the teacher's explanation.

Based on the results of the interview, the teacher stated that she created momentum, with the teacher providing several tricks. This was related to the results of interview quotes as follows.

Question 8: What do you do to make students focus only on the explanation and information provided?

Teacher: *"To make students focus in class, some of the tricks used include clapping and giving greetings to provoke their attention. However, the challenge is how to get students used to their gadgets focusing on listening to the teacher's directions. The teacher can stop the explanation and reprimand students who are not focused, and if necessary, re-explain individually for those who still have difficulty understanding".*

Scaffolding creates momentum. Based on the researcher's findings that the teacher applies creates momentum. The lesson given by the teacher makes the class very conducive, where all students work on assignments. Students also have sufficient motivation. Evidenced by students discussing with each other to ask questions. However, when the teacher provides information, there are some students who also communicate with each other, so that the teacher provides information or explanations that make other students not focus on receiving the teacher's explanation. However, there are several scoldings given by the teacher. First, clapping, second, giving greetings to provoke students. According to Hanan & Alin (2023), quality learning can be achieved through various ways such as using a variety of learning methods, student attitudes while learning, conducive learning atmosphere and situation, and using creative and varied learning media. Teachers must be competent so that interesting and varied learning will be created. The willingness to learn will increase with learning that suits students.

Conclusion

This study is qualitative research that aims to determine whether teachers at SMP Negeri 9 Kendari implement the characteristics of scaffolding in accordance with McKenzie's theory (1999). Data were obtained by conducting direct observations and interviews with teachers.

Based on the results of the research, from observations and interviews, it can be concluded that teacher implement the main characteristics of scaffolding actively:

1) Scaffolding Clear Directions: The teacher gives clear directions by using a high voice, gestures, and clear expressions. The teacher ensures students' understanding by providing examples and opportunities to ask questions.
2) Scaffolding clarifies purpose: The teacher only explained the clarifies purpose on the second day, but did not emphasize the importance of the purpose in daily life.
3) Scaffolding keeps on student task: The teacher always monitors, provides individual assistance, and gives feedback to ensure students stay focused and complete the task.
4) Scaffolding offers assessments to Clarify Expectations: The teacher provides examples, references, assessment rubrics, and grading standards to motivate students. The teacher provides extra time if needed.
5) Scaffolding points students to worthy sources: The teacher provides one reference via WhatsApp and lets the students search for additional references independently on the internet.
6) Scaffolding reduces uncertainties, surprise and disappointment: The teacher always checks students' writing, tests their understanding, and provides opportunities to correct mistakes.
7) Scaffolding delivers efficiency: Teachers give sufficient time to complete assignments and provide additional guidance for students who need more time.
8) Scaffolding creates momentum: The teacher keeps the class active and conducive by using techniques such as clapping and greetings to attract students' attention, as well as providing re-explanations when necessary.

References

Basri, M. D., Ampa, A. T., & Junaid, J. (2013). Syntactic Errors in Descriptive Paragraphs by Native Indonesian-Speaking Students of English. *International Journal of Linguistics*, *5*(5), 125. https://doi.org/10.5296/ijl.v5i5.4455

Susanto, D. (2011). *Pengantar Teori Sastra* (2nd ed.). Yogyakarta: CAPS.

Adji, S. E., and S. E. Peni Adji. 2012. "Karya Religius Danarto: Kajian Kritik Sastra Feminis." *Humaniora* 15(1): 23–38. https://journal.ugm.ac.id/jurnal-humaniora/article/view/771.

Basri, Muhammad D. 2016. "The First Phase of Assure Model to Develop Instructional Materials for The English Speaking Skills." In *Research on Educational Studies*, New Delhi: Serials Publication PVT. Ltd.

Beecher, Jonathan. 2012. "Utopian Moments Reading Utopian Texts." In *Utopian Moments Reading Utopian Texts*, eds. Miguel A. Ramiro Aviles and J.C Davis. London: Bloomsbury Academic, 92–98.

Foucault, Michel. 1995. *Discipline and Punish : The Birth of The Prison*. United State of America: Vintage Books.

Ma'ruf, Ahmad. 2012. "Aliran Pendidikan Dalam Perspektif Pendidikan Progresivisme Dan Esensialisme." *Jurnal Yudharta*.

Thoman, Elizabeth, and Tessa Jolls. 2005. *Literacy for the 21st Century*. United State of America: Center for Media Literacy.

Usman, Zuber. 1954. *Kesusastraan Lama Indonesia*. 4th ed. Jakarta: P.T Gunung Agung.